

**IEEE P7003 Working Group
Meeting Minutes
12 January 2017 /10:00 A.M. – 11:30 A.M. EST
Teleconference**

1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 10:01 A.M.

2. Roll call and Disclosure of [Affiliation](#)

The list of attendees present is attached.

3. Approval of January Agenda

Motion to approve the meeting agenda from 12th January, 2017. The agenda was approved as submitted without objection.

4. [IEEE Patent Policy](#) (Call for Patents)

The call for patents was raised; no one raised any concerns or any comments for consideration.

5. Approval of 8 December meeting minutes

Motion to approve the minutes from December 8th, 2017. The minutes from the December 8th, 2017 meeting were approved without objection.

6. Updated Outline Discussion

I. Review of progress on Draft Outline Document

Paula Boddington has had to step down as Vice-chair of the group, so nominations for a replacements are now open. See email sent by Ansgar 15th Jan following meeting.

Actions: Everyone to email Liz with (self-)nominations.

A conference call has taken place between all the chairs of the P7000 working groups. Highlighted the existence of a Glossary document worked on by the global initiative for terminology to be used in standards and so on – please contact them with problems about terminology etc.

https://standards.ieee.org/develop/indconn/ec/eadv2_glossary.pdf

It was pointed out that substantive work should be done on the standard between these calls – these are only to keep everyone up to date.

II. Assigning tasks to address outstanding issues

At least two people are needed to work on each section, there are many sections looking for volunteers. Primarily discussed sections 5-14. Email sent by Ansgar 15th January.

Volunteers listed below came forward during the meeting. Any other volunteers please add your name to the relevant section of the document.

- Key concepts and application of the standard: this is related to fairness, and the questions of what do we consider related to social norms and values. Bullet points at the moment but not worked into clear text yet. *Volunteers: Freyja, Suchana*
- Taxonomy: Pascal and Matthew already leading this
- Segmentation categories: this is to clarify how people are being grouped or classified into populations that algorithms are assigning certain results to.
- Identifying affected population groups: overlap with above meant agreement was reached to merge the two into 'Person categorization and identifying population groups'
- Legal frameworks related to bias: Marrousia, Peter, Freyja. *Volunteers: Stewart*
- Psychology of Bias: Paula may no longer have time to lead this. Maya suggested this topic might include consideration of empathy. Mark S contributed on this, suggesting consideration of the role of forgiveness and what it might look like – if a decision is irreversible, how does that effect things? Mark U suggested this has an important link with the software development life cycle. He also suggested that members of P7010 might be able to help. Ansgar pointed out that people may be biased towards creating things for people that are similar to themselves. Sriraj also agreed that context is so important, psych should be tied to the system development part. *Volunteers: Mark Underwood*
- Algorithmic system design stages – association to bias considerations: *Volunteers: Chris, Suchana.*
- Assurance of representativeness of testing and training data
- Algorithmic systems outcome evaluation
- Evaluation of algorithmic processing
- Assessment of resilience against external manipulation.
- Documenting and transparency: Suchana asked whether transparency meant auditable or explainable algorithm, or transparency at the level of the documentation itself in terms of accessibility and usability. Thoughts are that it is the second one. P7001 is working on Transparency of Autonomous Systems, however there is obviously a system transparency aspect to P7003 since we need clarity about algorithmic decision criteria in order to explain whether decision making is justified. *Volunteers: Christine Wolf*
- Preparing for use: perhaps to be addressed later.

Aim to have each of these groups do some work between the calls and then during calls we update on the work.

Action: Everyone to look at the document sections and volunteer for sections they wish to contribute to by adding their names to section titles.

III. Update on Use Cases

7 use cases so far – other P7000 chairs interested in them also. No new cases.

IV. Topic update: Bias Taxonomy

They are due to send email to remind people who have joined the last taxonomy call. *If anyone finds any technical documentation or news articles that link to taxonomy frameworks, please share.* Potential for white paper/discussion paper.

V. Topic update: Legal context

Awaiting next meeting to come up with plan for how to move forwards.

VI. Topic update: Psychology & Bias
No update

VII. AOB
Freyja provided an update on the Fat* NY workshop proposal. Not accepted as not appropriate for tutorial format. Maybe lunch session or other opportunities for discussion. Suchana commented that they may run a self-organised session, but they are still working with conference organisers to check if this will be possible. At the least they will send something out on mailing list to organize some kind of meet up over lunch or something. If anyone is going to be there please do join in.

Ansgar pointed out that people should be thinking not just in terms of what they are doing in contributing to the standards development document, but can contribute to papers, conferences, workshops etc. so if anyone sees an opportunity please get in touch and we'll organize something. Chris suggested KDD, will keep us updated and lead a proposal for a workshop (due February 23rd) which involves submitted papers to the workshops with presentations, and potentially progress key notes. Lilian also pointed out that lots of law conferences right now interested in algorithm bias, eg CPDP (24 jan deadline, we will try for 2019). Lilian can send a list and anyone who is interested or already going can organize a workshop. Also IGF would be good to connect to bigger governance community.

Actions: Chris to lead on KDD proposal; Lilian to send list of legal venues; anyone else with any ideas to send details.

Coordinating with other standards activities: Tim McGarr from the British Standards Institute contacted Lilian, and then Ansgar, regarding ISO/IEC initiatives for standards on AI. Ansgar explained that IEEE-SA procedure for providing input from IEEE standards project to ISO standards is via IEEE liaison. Ansgar will (virtually) meet with Tim to discuss P7003 and learn more about the activities of BSI in this area.

7. Future Meetings

Chris suggested we should use UTC rather than EST which was agreed to be more convenient. Both have been listed for transition.

Thursday, February 15th, 3:00pm-4:30pm (UST) /10:00am-11:30am (EST)

Wednesday, March 14th, 3:00pm-4:30pm (UST) /10:00am-11:30am (EST)

Tuesday, April 10th, 3:00pm-4:30pm (UST) /10:00am-11:30am (EST)

Monday, May 7th, 3:00pm-4:30pm (UST) /10:00am-11:30am (EST)

Friday, June 8th, 3:00pm-4:30pm (UST) /10:00am-11:30am (EST)

8. Adjourn

Meeting was adjourned at 11:05 AM

Attendees:

Last Name	First Name	Employer/Affiliation	Voting
Aiyer	Sriraj	UCL	
Biermann	BC	Heavy Projects & USC Innovation Lab	x
Citron	Danielle	University of Maryland	
Clifton	Chris	Purdue University	x
Courtney	Patrick	tec-connection	x
Dean	Sheila	Independent Author and Consultant	x
Dowthwaite	Liz	University of Nottingham	x
Duffy	Stewart	RadcliffesLeBrasseur	
Edwards	Lilian	University of Strathclyde	
Egawa	Takashi	NEC Corporation	x
Ganesh	Maya	Leuphana University	x
Koene (Chair)	Ansgar	University of Nottingham	x
McSherry	Madeline	Ada-AI	
Nyrup	Rune	Leverhulme Centre for the Future of Intelligence	
Piwowar	Kuba	University of Social Psychology and Humanities	
Rothwell	Lucy	Inspired Minds	
Seth	Suchana	Berkman Kelin Center and Data & Society	x
Sinders	Caroline	Wikimedia	
Stender	Matthew	Self	x
Towne	Ben	Sigma Resources	
Wolf	Christine	IBM Research	
Bahn	Christy	IEEE-SA (staff)	